



## A scale proposal for sustainable tourism in Cittaslows\*\*

\* İbrahim Taner AKKOÇ<sup>a</sup> , Nezihe Figen ERSOY ARCA<sup>b</sup> 

<sup>a</sup> Ondokuz Mayıs University, Faculty of Tourism, Department of Tourism Management, Samsun/Turkey

<sup>b</sup> Anadolu University, FEAS, Department of Business Administration, Eskisehir/Turkey

### Article History

Received: 07.07.2022

Accepted: 29.08.2022

### Keywords

Sustainable tourism

Cittaslow movement

Local development

Scale development

### Abstract

The number of slow cities has reached 266 as of August 2021 throughout the world, and 18 of these cities are located in Turkey. The total number has been increasing over the years. Considering this growth, revealing the impacts of Cittaslow Movement in terms of sustainable development becomes more important. The research problem is the need for a measurement tool that would reveal the thoughts and opinions of local people living in slow cities in order to determine the economic, social, and environmental impacts. Within this context, the purpose of this study is to develop a scale to measure environmental, social, and economic impacts of Cittaslow Movement on local people. Accordingly, the exploratory sequential design, one of the mixed methods is used, where qualitative and quantitative research processes are conducted, respectively. Therefore, in-depth interviews were conducted with 8 participants in the qualitative phase of this study. Data were collected from 9 different slow cities via the scale form developed based on the codes obtained at the qualitative phase. The data were analyzed through exploratory factor analysis and confirmatory factor analysis, respectively. At the end of this study, a scale containing 40 statements and 8-factor structure, was developed.

### Article Type

Research Article

\* Corresponding Author

E-mail: [ibrahimtaner.akkoc@omu.edu.tr](mailto:ibrahimtaner.akkoc@omu.edu.tr) (İ. T. Akkoç)

DOI: 10.21325/jotags.2022.1071

\*\*This paper is based on research which was carried out for a doctoral dissertation at Institute of Social Sciences, Anadolu University.

## **INTRODUCTION**

In today's developing world, global enterprises, such as Starbucks and McDonald's, have started to appear. By offering their fast-moving consumer goods in local markets, these enterprises have become a threat for local products and cultural values (Yurtseven, 2010). The only way to eliminate the negative impacts of globalization is to transform destinations by protecting their unique values. Gastronomy author Carlo Petrini has become the first person to take a different standgo at an international level. Carlo Petrini and his fellows argued against McDonald's' attempt to open a restaurant at the historical Spanish Steps in Rome and they laid the foundations of an international movement by protesting McDonald's' initiative. This movement is called the Slow Food Movement (Sander-Regier, 2004). These protests have gained recognition in various regions of the world, and the Slow Food Movement has given rise to other slow movements with the idea that this philosophy could be used in many other fields, such as education, health, and tourism. One of these movements is the Cittaslow Movement (Ünal & Zavalı, 2016).

The slow cities, which became popular with the notion of slowness against the negative impacts of fast life, have begun to turn into significant destinations. The increasing number of slow cities is the proof of this transformation. As of August 2021, there has been 266 small cities and towns that possess the Cittaslow Certificate registered to 20 Cittaslow networks in 30 countries. Seferihisar town of Izmir city has become the first slow city in Turkey in 2009. 17 more towns have later been included in Cittaslow network, and a total of 18 towns in Turkey have become slow cities ([www.cittaslowturkiye.org](http://www.cittaslowturkiye.org), 2020).

Cittaslow Movement is born from Slow Food Movement. Slow Food Movement is a global, grassroots organization, to prevent the disappearance of local food cultures and traditions, counteract the rise of fast life and combat people's dwindling interest in the food they eat, where it comes from and how our food choices affect the world around us ([www.slowfood.com](http://www.slowfood.com), 2018). The Slow Food Movement was found to protect local enterprises such as restaurants and farms. "Locality" is at the core of this movement. On the other hand, regional distinction is eliminated in Cittaslow Movement, and development of a wider region is projected (Mayer & Knox, 2006). The main goal of Cittaslow is to enlarge the philosophy of Slow Food to local communities and urban life, applying the concepts of eco-gastronomy at practice of everyday life ([www.cittaslow.org](http://www.cittaslow.org), Association, 2018). The criteria for Cittaslow Movement are specified under the Requirements for Excellence section of Cittaslow Regulations. A slow city should fulfill at least 50% of 72 criteria in 7 main fields in Requirements for Excellence and should fulfill at least one criterion from each main field ([www.cittaslow.org](http://www.cittaslow.org), Charter, 2018).

The Cittaslow Movement aims to bring a socially powerful and environmentally conscious urban and tourism philosophy that protects the economic resources (Karadeniz, 2014). Conditions, such as locality, peacefulness, and authentic cuisines that became evident with the Cittaslow Movement have become factors of attraction for the visitors, and these may bring along significant impacts on local people, environment, and the enterprises. In this respect, the balance between positive and negative impacts of tourism activities becomes more of an issue for the success of sustainable tourism (Jung, Ineson & Miller, 2014). Ekinçi (2014) discussed the Cittaslow philosophy from the viewpoint of sustainable tourism and suggested new slow cities in Turkey by comparing current and potential slow cities. While the researcher stated that the potential slow cities in all intents and purposes meet the requirements of sustainable tourism by meeting the Cittaslow criteria, he also suggested that the Cittaslow

Movement and its impacts should be investigated in detail.

It is important to reveal the repercussions of the Cittaslow Movement on environmental, social, economic development, and the development of local people. Have these regions made significant environmental, economic, and social progress? If yes, were these developments only beneficial for the local enterprises or were they also beneficial for the local people? In other words, has the Cittaslow Movement turned into a tourism marketing instrument and become a notion that only the traditional entrepreneurs would utilize? In short, what are the positive or negative repercussions of the developments brought by Cittaslow Movement on local people? Seeking answers for these questions concerning social, environmental, and economic fields is significant in terms of revealing the areas that a slow city has developed or didn't evolve.

The aim of the Cittaslow Movement is to protect the local values, highlight the local differences and contribute to sustainability in terms of economic, social and environmental impacts. However, in the literature, no comprehensive studies were found regarding the contributions or negative impacts of Cittaslow Movement on local people and the country. The lack of a scale that reveals the economic, social and environmental effects of Cittaslow Movement on the region constitutes the main problem of the research. In this context, the purpose of this study is to develop a scale peculiar to Cittaslow that measures the environmental, social and economic impacts of the Cittaslow Movement on the region based on the thoughts and opinions of the local people.

Lack of a scale for slow cities, which would help revealing these impacts, indicates significant deficiencies in many aspects. For example, significant impacts regarding various issues, such as whether there has been an increase in production of local products, whether rural depopulation has been prevented, whether new fields of business have been opened for women, and whether the environmental degradation has increased or not, are waiting to be determined. With the attainment of the purpose of the study, a scale, which will measure sustainability of tourism activities by determining the areas that a slow city has developed or dropped behind, will be presented to the literature. In addition, since the criteria to become a slow city are the same all over the world, this scale will be applicable for all slow cities worldwide.

## **Literature Review**

### **The Relationship Between Sustainable Tourism and Cittaslow Movement**

Since the Cittaslow Movement aims to meet today's needs without hindering the needs of future generations, this movement is centered around sustainable development (Pink, 2008). Agenda 21, which was one of the most critical outcomes of 1992 United Nations Conference on Environment and Development (Rio de Janeiro Earth Summit) regarding sustainable development, constitutes 21st century's sustainable development action plan. It emphasizes that the international authorities should encourage the local governments to fulfill commitments for sustainable development at a regional level (UNEP, 2003). When the objectives and criteria of Cittaslow Movement, which was designed as a local development model, is analyzed, it is observed that they run parallel with the criteria of Agenda 21, and they are directly related to the notion of sustainability and sustainable development (Mayer & Knox, 2006; Pink, 2008; Dinçer, Ofluoğlu & Öz, 2015).

Kartal and Öztürk, (2016) compared the Sustainable Tourism Objectives determined by the United Nations Environment Program (UNEP) and World Tourism Organization (UNWTO) and Cittaslow criteria and emphasized

similarities between them. In addition, Güneş, Çalışkan and Aslan (2015), compared 32 sustainable tourism criteria of Global Sustainable Tourism Council (GSTC), which were determined to ensure sustainability in tourism, sectoral social responsibility, environmental interaction, and to observe cultural impacts, with Cittaslow criteria, and revealed similarities between them.

In order to become a Cittaslow member, conditions, such as environmental policies, infrastructure, preserving the urban texture, supporting local production and products, and hospitality, should be fulfilled. The purpose of sustainable tourism is to develop a tourism plan, which gives priority to local community, and which contributes to the lives and economy of the local people without damaging the environment, society, and historical, natural, and cultural assets. In this respect, the principles of sustainable tourism and the criteria of Cittaslow Movement coincide (Karadeniz, 2014).

### **The impact of Cittaslow Movement on Economic Sustainability**

The economic dimension of sustainability concerns the use of scarce resources. In order to talk about economic sustainability, it is necessary to produce goods and services on the basis of continuity, to avoid sectoral imbalances that negatively affect agricultural and industrial production, and to ensure the sustainability of domestic and foreign debts at a manageable level (Tıraş, 2012). Accordingly, in a study conducted by Mayer ve Knox (2006), the Cittaslow Movement was discussed as an alternative approach to urban development within the context of local resources containing economic, cultural, and historical assets. This study also emphasized that alternative community-based, locally-driven and environmentally-friendly practices may be built, which strengthen the economy, and encourage local development strategies. Finally, it was suggested that the Cittaslow Movement might be used as a brand to attract tourists, and that the shareholders and local business works would be satisfied more with these primary goals, such as protecting the environment, local economy, and sustainability. Nilsson, Svård, Widarsson and Wirell (2011) discussed the slow cities as a means for development of a destination with their eco-gastronomic heritage. For the three different Italian towns analyzed in this study, it was suggested that the Cittaslow Movement contributed to the development of the region through some certain destination resources, such as local identity and local gastronomic assets. Another result of the research is that the Cittaslow concept can affect the product development and image of a destination.

The studies on the relationship between CittaSlow movement and the sustainable economy have been given above. But, Cittaslow Movement has its own specific criteria regarding the economic field. For this reason, it would be more accurate to base the questions to be asked to the participants in a research on these criteria. Accordingly, the first question asked to the participants in the qualitative phase of the research was as follows: What did you aim for when you actualized the economic criteria of Cittaslow?

### **The impact of Cittaslow Movement on Environmental Sustainability**

The environmental dimension of sustainability is related to meeting the resource and service needs of both present and future generations without ignoring environmental health. In this respect, environmental sustainability regulates the flexibility and balance conditions for our actions that reduce biodiversity, while ensuring the continuity of service production necessary to meet human needs without exceeding the ecosystems' own capacity (Morelli, 2011). An environmentally sustainable system turns to renewable resources, thus preventing the depletion

of existing resources (Tıraş, 2012). “The Cittaslow Movement advocates that life should be lived at an appropriate level to enjoy life. This movement started off with the purpose of becoming a realistic, sustainable, and self-contained alternative to cities, where people can communicate with each other, protecting their handicrafts, nature, customs, and traditions, but at the same time, having no infrastructural issues, and using renewable energy sources and technology” (www.cittaslowturkiye.org, 2018). Coşar (2013), pointed out that depending on the development of calm cities, the region may receive immigration and its population may increase. The researcher emphasized that depending on this situation, problems such as an increase in construction, noise pollution and traffic congestion may arise. Another result of the research is the possibility of decreasing the service quality due to the increase in the number of daily visitors.

The relationship between Cittaslow movement and the sustainable environment have been given above. But, Cittaslow Movement has its own environmental criteria. For this reason, it would be more accurate to base the questions to be asked to the participants in a research on these criteria. Accordingly, the second question asked to the participants in the qualitative phase of the research was as follows: What did you aim for when you actualized the environmental criteria of Cittaslow?

### **The impact of Cittaslow Movement on Social Sustainability**

The social dimension of sustainability is related to the distribution of various social services to the society in a fair and adequate way based on equal opportunities, including health, education, gender equality, transparency and participatory society (Assefa & Frostell, 2007). Social sustainability includes efforts to create physical, cultural and social areas that improve social sensitivity and welfare, and to ensure interaction with individuals in these areas (Bilgili, 2017). The Cittaslow Movement, which has sustainability and prosperity on its agenda, aims to make the city more livable by preserving and improving the quality of life and focusing on local differences (Mayer & Knox, 2006). The research for the Italian town of Orvieto, Loades (2005), determined that as the movement spread, ideas such as ethnocentrism and narrow-mindedness decreased and integrated into globalization by preserving the local values of the region. Pink (2008) examined the impacts of Cittaslow Movement on the process of social transformation by linking together the local concerns and environmental issues. At the end of this study, it was found that the Cittaslow Movement affected the communities and local groups at an individual, local, national, and international level within the process of social transformation. Park & Kim (2016) studied the philosophy and practices of Cittaslow, which aims to increase the power and involvement of local communities in the tourism industry, where the sustainable tourism understanding prevails. In this qualitative study, it was found that the Cittaslow Movement encourages the local people’s participation in decision-making processes, and also enlivens the region through its local assets and local delicacies. Accordingly, the Cittaslow Movement is considered as a significant opportunity for local people to participate in decision making-processes for tourism planning and development.

The relationship between Cittaslow movement and the social sustainability have been given above. But, Cittaslow Movement has its own specific criteria regarding the social field. For this reason, it would be more accurate to base the questions to be asked to the participants in a research on these criteria. Accordingly, the third question asked to the participants in the qualitative phase of the research was as follows: What did you aim for when you actualized the social criteria of Cittaslow?

As it is seen in the literature, there are limited number of studies that discuss the status of slow cities, which have become significant destinations, in terms of sustainable tourism. Another general outcome from these studies is that they mostly emphasized the impact of Cittaslow Movement on the economic aspect of sustainability. However, the number of results on the impact of this movement on the environmental aspect of sustainability is quite limited. The most striking point in the studies is that although Cittaslow have its own specific criteria, the researches were not carried out based on these specific criteria of Cittaslow and could not reveal comprehensive results that included all these criteria. As it can be seen, there is a need for a measurement tool peculiar to calm cities with proven validity and reliability that reveals the economic, environmental and social effects of sustainable tourism as a whole.

## **Methodology**

The Mixed method approach is adopted in the design of this study, where the qualitative and quantitative methods are both used within the framework of the determined research problem. Within this context, the research design is determined as exploratory sequential mixed method. In this research design, the researcher first carries out a qualitative research, and then explores the thoughts of the participants on the research subject. The data obtained are analyzed and the foundations of the following quantitative research process are laid (Creswell, 2017). Accordingly, first, a qualitative research was conducted with the participants, who introduced the Cittaslow Movement into Turkey. Thus, the ideas these participants had in mind when it comes to the Cittaslow Movement in economic, social, and environmental terms have been revealed. At the next stage, a scale was developed based on the data obtained through the previous qualitative research. Then the repercussions of these goals determined by the participants on local people have been revealed through this scale.

### ***Study 1: Qualitative Research Process***

Interviews were conducted through semi-structured interview forms with eight people, who are the official representatives of Cittaslow Turkey Organization, and who actualized the slow city movement in Turkey. In interview form method, the principal aim is to obtain same kind of information from different people in order to focus on similar subjects. The interview form contains three main questions, which scrutinize social, economic, and environmental aspects of the participants' goal of introducing the Cittaslow Movement into Turkey. The main purpose of these questions is to obtain data necessary for the quantitative research in order to develop a sustainable local development scale for slow cities. These questions are listed below:

1. What did you aim for when you actualized the economic criteria of Cittaslow?
2. What did you aim for when you actualized the environmental criteria of Cittaslow?
3. What did you aim for when you actualized the social criteria of Cittaslow?

### **In-depth Interviews**

The interviews were conducted with eight participants between 18.05.2019 and 28.06.2019 in different cities. Before asking these questions to the participants, a "Participant Consent Form" was created in order to prevent any ethical issues, and the participants were asked to fill out these forms in order to prove their voluntary participation. The reason for using this "Participant Consent Form" is that it is a widely used method in qualitative studies in

order to prevent any ethical concerns (Creswell, 2013). The interviews conducted with eight people within the framework of the questions on the interview form took 8 hours and 33 minutes in total, and all interviews were recorded with a tape recorder. Table 1 shows the information about the place, date, time, and participant's title concerning these interviews.

**Table 1.** Information regarding the Place and Date of the Interviews

	Participant Code	Organizational Position	The Place/City of Interview	Date and Time of the Interview
1	K1	Science Committee	Eskisehir	15.05.2019 - 09.30
2	K2	Secretariat	Izmir	17.06.2019 - 11.00
3	K3	Science Committee	Izmir	17.06.2019 - 15.45
4	K4	Technical Coordinator	Izmir	18.06.2019 - 10.20
5	K5	Secretariat	Izmir	18.06.2019 - 13.00
6	K6	Science Committee	Eskisehir	20.06.2019 - 14.00
7	K7	Science Committee	Istanbul	27.06.2019 - 17.30
8	K8	Science Committee	Istanbul	28.06.2019 - 10.00

### Content Analysis

The audio files in the tape recorder were deciphered with a computer software named VoiceDocs. The content analysis technique, which is commonly used in qualitative research method, was used for the analysis of the deciphered texts. NVivo qualitative data analysis program was used to analyze the data. After transferring the organized data to the relevant program, the raw data similar or having the same meaning were collected to form sections. Next, these sections were coded. After completing the coding process, the similar codes were collected and grouped under themes to be interpreted. According to the findings obtained at the end of the content analysis, 3 themes and 55 codes were detected. These themes were named based on social, economic, and environmental aspects of sustainable development, which is the main subject of this study. Each theme, together with their codes, are given in Table 2.

**Table 2.** Themes and codes

Themes	Codes
<i>Economy</i>	Reproduction of local products
	Increase in the number of local manufacturers
	Sales of local foods
	Revival of traditional professions
	Increase in agricultural production
	Local products sold by local manufacturers
	Increase in the number of tourists
	Increase in the sorts of tourism
	Local people's participation in production
	Increase in the number of boutique/small-scale hotels
	Elimination of mediators
	Tourist satisfaction
	Increased earnings of local manufacturers
	Increased employment
	Increased number of female entrepreneurs
	Increase in value of traditional products
	Conscious local entrepreneurs
	Branding of products
	Increased recognition of the region
	Appraisal of unexploited areas
Emergence of producer's cooperatives	
Protection of heirlooms	
Increase in the number of external entrepreneurs	

**Table 2.** Themes and codes (cont.)

<b>Environment</b>	Use of renewable energy sources
	Clean air, soil, and water
	Construction of treatment facilities
	Increased housing/settlement
	Appraisal of historical buildings
	Unearthed archaeological sites
	Increase in use of wood
	Increase in use of bicycles
	Increase in the number of visiting vehicles
	Protection of indigenous plants and animals
	Natural methods in agricultural activities
	Protection of green fields
	<b>Social</b>
Living standards of the disabled and the elderly	
Various communities for women	
Better conditions for children	
Female labor force participation	
Involvement of young population in the decision-making processes	
Decrease in youth migration	
Increased rates of immigration	
Liaising of the authorities and the people	
Fair source distribution among the manufacturers	
Increase in the number of traditional events	
Appraisal of cultural elements	
Socialization of people	
Enlightenment of people	
Raising people's awareness	
New structures in harmony with the historical and cultural texture	
Building new parking lots	
Urban signboard guidance	
Tolerance for tourism	
Rent-seeking in real-estate industry	

### Validity and Reliability of Data

Creswell (2013) mentioned eight strategies, and he recommended researchers to use at least two of them in order to ensure internal validity of the data obtained at the end of the research process. These strategies may be listed as follows: long-term participation and continuous observation, triangulation, peer review or inquiry, adverse condition analysis, explanation for the biases of the researcher, member control, rich and intense description, external auditing. Most of these strategies were fulfilled in this study. Accordingly, the impacts of tourism activities in slow cities were observed within the scope of long-term participation and continuous observation. In addition, apart from the interviews conducted with the participants, the opinions of the local people were also taken in some of the slow cities. Finally, the findings obtained from both qualitative and quantitative research were used. The findings obtained from adverse condition analysis were thoroughly analyzed in terms of their conformance with the literature. Within the scope of external auditing, the feedbacks of thesis advisor and the research associates in the monitoring committee were used. As for the rich and intense description, all details regarding the participants and the entire research process were given with the help of tables. For the strategy on the researcher's biases, the researcher did his utmost to avoid biased evaluations throughout the thesis research process.

In order to ensure external validity of the research, detailed descriptions were given by first reorganizing the raw data according to the determined themes and conveying these without putting any different complexions on findings. In addition, criterion sampling method, which is one of the purposeful sampling methods, was preferred



within the qualitative research process. For this purpose, since the research is about slow cities, only the formally commissioned individuals were included within the sample, who ensured that the slow city movement was actualized.

In order to present the reliability of the data obtained at the end of the qualitative research process, the readers were clearly informed that viable path was followed at all stages of the research including the research approach, preparation of the interview form, data collection process, and data analysis. In addition, three academicians, who had previous studies on sustainable development and slow cities, have read the interview texts as coders for content analysis, and each coder has individually completed the encoding process through the data. Then, the modules determined separately by each coder were used jointly by all coders in order to categorize these codes. Finally, all categories were reviewed by the coders and these three themes were determined accordingly.

Finally, the coded statements that were obtained through content analysis were transformed into questions, and as a result, the statements that were considered to be necessary for the scale form were determined. Then, the opinions of a specialist were asked in order to carry out evaluations for corrections, eliminating unnecessary statements, or adding new statements. Within this context, a specialist's opinion form was created. This form, including scale statements, was reviewed by 11 specialists, who conducted studies on basic marketing, tourism marketing, destination management and marketing, sustainable tourism, Cittaslow Movement, innovation and entrepreneurship, communication, and research methods. These specialists evaluated the statements in this scale as "necessary", if they thought a statement should be included in this scale; as "necessary but insufficient", if they thought a statement should take part in this scale, but it should be rearranged; as "unnecessary, if they thought a statement should not be incorporated in this scale.

### ***Study 2: Quantitative Research Process***

The second stage of this research process was conducted through quantitative research method. A scale form was prepared based on the data obtained through the qualitative research process, and data were collected from the local residents of some certain slow cities through this form. By means of the data obtained, it was aimed to develop a Cittaslow Sustainable Tourism Scale applicable to all slow cities in terms of tourism. Thanks to this scale, it is now possible to compare the goals and expectations of the participants, who actualized this Cittaslow Movement, and the actual impacts observed at the end of this process.

### **Research Population and Sampling Process**

The local people of the first nine slow cities in Turkey constitute the research population. The research population was determined in this manner because the slow cities are inspected every 5 years in order to make sure that they continue to comply with the criteria ([www.cittaslow.org](http://www.cittaslow.org), 2019). This means that these nine cities comply with the Cittaslow criteria and hold their Cittaslow statuses. If this wasn't the case, the cities that fail to comply with these criteria may lose their Cittaslow titles as per the decisions taken by the Cittaslow administrative body ([www.cittaslow.org](http://www.cittaslow.org), 2019). Another reason for selecting these nine cities is that these cities have been holding to their Slow City titles for too long and this gives us the chance to thoroughly reveal the social, economic, and environmental impacts. Convenience sampling method is preferred in this study, which is usually chosen when it is not possible to be certain of the chance of selection of each element constituting the population, and which is one of the sampling techniques that is not based on probability.

## Data Collection

The scale form consists of two parts. The first part includes 55 statements obtained from the interviews and aim to measure the impacts of the slow city movement in social, economic, and environmental terms. It was planned to measure the perceptions of the local people living in slow cities regarding these statements with a 5-point Likert type scale, as 1 being “Strongly Disagree” and 5 being “Strongly Agree”. The second part of the scale form contains statements that aim to reveal the demographic attributes, such as age, gender, profession, etc. After taking its final shape, the scale form went through a pilot test to verify its reliability. within this context, the pilot test was conducted with 32 participants living in Taraklı on 07.09.2019. The Cronbach Alpha coefficient was calculated as 0,92 and the scale was found to be highly reliable. After completing the pilot test, the actual data collection process started on 25.12.2019. The research data were collected from nine cities, which have passed their 5-year inspections and maintained their slow city titles. A sampling volume containing 439 people has been attained at the end of the data collection process.

## Quantitative Data Analysis

The data were meticulously coded before the analysis process, and then SPSS 24.0 statistical package program was used for EFA, and AMOS 24 was used for CFA. Some conditions that should be ensured in a measuring tool were satisfied in order to implement this analysis method. After transferring the data into the above statistical programs, some conditions, such as missing data, excess value, and whether they display a normal distribution, have been analyzed in detail. Accordingly, values were assigned to variables with missing data through Series Average Method, which is one of the approximate value assignment methods (Mertler & Reinhart, 2002). Histograms and graphs of variables regarding observations with excess values were analyzed (Alpar, 2013), and it was observed that the data of 22 observations displayed excess values. Therefore, the data obtained from these observations were not analyzed. As such, all analyses regarding reliability and construct validity of the scale were performed over the data obtained from 417 observations. The data set was randomly divided into two and EFA was applied to one of the created datasets and DFA to the other. Cameron (2004) stated that if case kurtosis and skewness values are between  $\pm 2$  range, the data would display a normal distribution. When the research data was analyzed, it was observed that the kurtosis and skewness values ranged between  $\pm 2$ . After ensuring univariate normality condition, Bartlett's Test of Sphericity results have also been checked, which shows whether the data display a multivariate normal distribution, and which points out that significant factors may be derived from the correlation matrix. Bartlett's Test of Sphericity reveals whether the data come from a multivariate normal distribution (Çokluk, Şekercioğlu and Büyüköztürk, 2014). Accordingly, significant results were obtained from Bartlett's Test of Sphericity with 11515.349 Chi-square and  $p=0.000$  values.

In addition to these, Kaiser-Mayer-Olkin (KMO) value, which shows whether the data set has a sufficient sample size, should also be calculated. The KMO value is expected to range between 0.50 and 1.00 (Malhotra, 2010). For another test technique, which determines whether the data set is suitable for EFA, Bartlett's Test of Sphericity coefficient that reveals whether there is a significant relationship among all variables in the research population is analyzed (Altunışık, Coşkun, Bayraktaroğlu & Yıldırım 2012) and this coefficient is expected to be  $p<0.5$  (Saruhan and Özdemirci, 2013, s. 203). In consideration of these explanations, with 0.915 KMO value, it was understood that the data set had a sufficient sample size. However, it was observed with 11515.349 Chi-square and

$p=0.000$  values, Bartlett's Test of Sphericity created significant results, and there was an ideal relationship level among the variables for factor analysis.

## Findings

In order to test the construct validity of the scale, which was found to be reliable, first EFA, and then CFA were performed in order to verify the factor structure of the scale. The findings of these analyses are listed below:

### EFA findings regarding Cittaslow sustainable tourism scale

It is necessary to know the factor extraction method and the number of factors required while performing factor analysis. Accordingly, Maximum Likelihood method was preferred as the factor extraction method. This method, which is also commonly used in confirmatory factor analysis, maximizes the relationship between the factors and the variables (Tabachnick & Fidell, 2013). The factors with eigenvalue of 1 or above have been taken into consideration in factor analysis. Varimax rotation method, which is one of the most preferred vertical rotation methods, was used as factor rotation method. Netemeyer, Bearden and Sharma (2003) stated that factor load values over 0.40 would give a stronger factor structure. Based on these explanations, the variables with factor load values of 0.40 or above have been included in EFA, since they both present a significant value and contribute to higher variance values.

In consideration of these explanations regarding factor load values, 11 items have been excluded from EFA due to low factor load, and 2 items have been excluded since they had overlapping factor loads. It was also observed that one of the items in this scale has formed a univariate structure without falling into any factors even though it had a higher factor load value. Altunışık, et al, (2012) suggested that the factors with a significant loading by itself should be excluded from the analysis. Apart from these, a statement within this scale was found not to be within the acceptable range in terms of the entire correlation value with 0.20 coefficient value. Büyüköztürk, et al. (2014) suggested that the items with 0.20 or lower coefficient value should be excluded from the scale. Based on this explanation, this statement was not included within the analyses to be made to ensure construct validity.

Consequently, an eight-factor structure containing 40 items was obtained at the end of EFA. The summary information regarding EFA results are given in Table 3.

**Table 3.** EFA findings regarding cittaslow sustainable tourism scale

Factors and Statements	Variance (%)	Average	S.D.	Factor Loading
<b>Increasing Value of Historical and Cultural Heritage (<math>\alpha=0.940</math>)</b>	11.830			
The historical buildings were renovated and became useful for the economy.		2.751	1.2423	.893
Heirlooms were taken under preservation.		2.825	1.3176	.811
The use of wood has increased in new buildings.		2.791	1.3630	.795
The ruins and wastelands became useful for the local economy.		2.832	1.2425	.710
Indigenous plants and animal species were taken under protection.		2.887	1.3986	.705
Archaeological sites were unearthed and taken under protection.		2.926	1.2735	.659
<b>Increased Production (<math>\alpha=0.896</math>)</b>	11.314			
Agricultural production has increased.		2.904	1.2899	.718
The number of local manufacturers has increased.		3.153	1.3321	.710
The local products of the past (food-beverage, traditional clothing, handicrafts, etc.) have been revived.		3.012	1.4403	.709
The number of visitors has increased.		3.415	1.3039	.689
The local manufacturers have begun to sell their own products in the market.		3.252	1.2847	.639
Our local foods are now sold in restaurants or markets.		3.161	1.3411	.611

**Table 3.** EFA findings regarding cittaslow sustainable tourism scale (cont.)

Tourism types suitable for our region (yacht tourism, highland tourism, culture tourism, etc.) have begun to emerge.		3.245	1.2510	.564
The forgotten traditional professions have revived.		2.839	1.2012	.465
<b>Local-Cultural Belonging (<math>\alpha=0.875</math>)</b>	7.868			
Traditional events and activities (festivals, festivities, contests, etc.) have begun to be organized.		3.374	1.2630	.843
Our cultural values (music, dance, local goods, etc.) have begun to gain value.		3.456	1.2985	.759
The local people are now encouraged to socialize through sports, dance, and cultural activities.		3.177	1.2961	.672
The young and the children have begun to get involved in the decision-making processes.		3.096	1.2806	.645
The authorities and the people have begun to act in liaison.		3.173	1.2282	.539
<b>Economic Growth (<math>\alpha=0.840</math>)</b>	7.131			
The traditional products have begun to gain economic value.		3.322	1.2546	.739
The number of female entrepreneurs has begun to increase.		3.492	1.1886	.659
The employment opportunities have increased.		3.230	1.2008	.571
The local entrepreneurs have begun to become more conscious regarding economic activities.		3.149	1.2793	.536
Local manufacturers have begun to earn more money.		3.402	1.2285	.502
<b>Raising Environmental Awareness (<math>\alpha=0.864</math>)</b>	6.863			
Organic methods have been used in agricultural activities.		2.986	1.2934	.845
Treatment facilities have been built.		2.938	1.2271	.670
The air, soil, and water have become clearer.		3.144	1.2455	.542
The trees and green fields have been protected.		3.072	1.2746	.540
Renewable energy sources, such as, solar, wind, etc., have begun to be used.		2.962	1.2123	.481
<b>Equal Opportunities (<math>\alpha=0.848</math>)</b>	6.472			
The rate of youth migration has decreased.		3.189	1.2228	.745
Female participation in labor force has increased.		3.405	1.2252	.664
The resources (energy, knowledge, physical area, etc.) necessary for production have been fairly distributed.		3.141	1.2254	.620
The local people have been sufficiently informed about the Cittaslow process.		3.403	1.2329	.592
<b>Local Empowerment (<math>\alpha=0.865</math>)</b>	6.047			
Small-scale enterprises, such as boutique hotels and guest houses have emerged.		3.424	1.2727	.735
The local manufacturers have begun to sell their products directly without mediators.		3.207	1.2541	.645
The local people have been encouraged to participate in production process.		3.108	1.2992	.611
Producer's cooperatives have begun to emerge.		3.164	1.2547	.576
<b>Urban Life Quality (<math>\alpha=0.887</math>)</b>	4.792			
New structures have been built in harmony with the historical and cultural texture.		3.163	1.2079	.870
New parking lots have been built.		3.242	1.2115	.614
Informative signboards have been placed throughout the streets and shops around the city.		3.182	1.2501	.598
<b>Total (<math>\alpha=0.951</math>)</b>	<b>62.317%</b>			

Kaiser-Meyer-Olkin Measure of Sampling Adequacy: 0.915

Bartlett's Test of Sphericity/ Chi-square value: 11515.349, sd: 780, p: 0.000

As can be seen in Table 3, which shows the summary of EFA results, an 8-factor structure containing forty statements has been found. It is observed that all statements within this scale have factor loads that range between 0.465 and 0.893, and these are within the acceptable range. The fact that the Cronbach's Alpha values calculated for each one of these eight factors range between 0.84 and 0.94 and the total  $\alpha$  value of this structure is 0.95 indicate that this is a reliable measurement tool. This measurement tool containing eight factors explains 62.13% of the total variance, and it is considered as an ideal value (Tabachnick & Fidell, 2013). When naming these factors, the sustainable tourism criteria and goals determined by Global Sustainable Tourism Council (GSTC), United Nations Environment Program (UNEP), and World Tourism Organization (UNWTO), and the aspects covering the Cittaslow criteria (www.cittaslow.org, 2021) were used.

### CFA Findings Regarding Cittaslow Sustainable Tourism Scale

CFA was performed in order to verify the eight-factor structure that represent forty variables obtained from EFA. One of the fundamental indicators to be considered in CFA is the standardized factor load value of the variables. The factor load values should be statistically significant and should be minimum 0.50, but should ideally be 0.70 or above (Malhotra, 2010). The AVE (Average Variance Extracted) value that is calculated for construct validity should be above 0.50. In addition, another indicator that should be reviewed to ensure validity is the CR (Composite Reliability) value. CR value should ideally be 0.70 or above (Malhotra, 2010). CR value also enables us to evaluate the measurement tool in terms of reliability (Hair, Black, Babin, and Anderson 2014, s. 123). All values for the indicators considered for evaluation of CFA results are given in Table 4.

**Table 4.** CFA Findings Regarding Cittaslow Sustainable Tourism Scale

Code	Factors and Statements	Factor Load	t-value	CR	AVE
<b>TKMD</b>	<b>Increasing Value of Historical and Cultural Heritage</b>			<b>.923</b>	<b>.668</b>
TKMD1	The historical buildings were renovated and became useful for the economy.	.929			
TKMD2	Heirlooms were taken under preservation.	.850	25.875		
TKMD2	The use of wood has increased in new buildings.	.841	25.258		
TKMD3	The ruins and wastelands became useful for the local economy.	.776	21.333		
TKMD4	Indigenous plants and animal species were taken under protection.	.764	20.720		
TKMD5	Archaeological sites were unearthed and taken under protection.	.728	18.942		
<b>UA</b>	<b>Increase in Production</b>			<b>.895</b>	<b>.519</b>
UA1	Agricultural production has increased.	.759			
UA2	The number of local manufacturers has increased.	.774	16.114		
UA3	The local products of the past (food-beverage, traditional clothing, handicrafts, etc.) have been revived.	.802	16.757		
UA4	The number of visitors has increased.	.742	15.324		
UA5	The local manufacturers have begun to sell their own products in the market.	.707	14.542		
UA6	Our local foods are now sold in restaurants or markets.	.697	14.330		
UA7	Tourism types suitable for our region (yacht tourism, highland tourism, culture tourism, etc.) have begun to emerge.	.646	13.113		
UA8	The forgotten traditional professions have revived.	.616	12.498		
<b>YKA</b>	<b>Local-Cultural Belonging</b>			<b>.868</b>	<b>.575</b>
YKA1	Traditional events and activities (festivals, festivities, contests, etc.) have begun to be organized.	.883			
YKA2	Our cultural values (music, dance, local goods, etc.) have begun to gain value.	.872	22.604		
YKA3	The local people are now encouraged to socialize through sports, dance, and cultural activities.	.757	18.341		
YKA4	The young and the children have begun to get involved in the decision-making processes.	.653	14.820		
YKA5	The authorities and the people have begun to act in liaison.	.579	12.625		
<b>EB</b>	<b>Economic Growth</b>			<b>.844</b>	<b>.521</b>
EB1	The traditional products have begun to gain economic value.	.798			
EB2	The number of female entrepreneurs has begun to increase.	.732	15.263		
EB3	The employment opportunities have increased.	.729	15.197		
EB4	The local entrepreneurs have begun to become more conscious regarding economic activities.	.689	14.239		
EB5	Local manufacturers have begun to earn more money.	.652	13.373		

**Table 4.** CFA Findings Regarding Cittaslow Sustainable Tourism Scale (cont.)

<b>CBO</b>	<b>Environmental Awareness</b>			<b>.869</b>	<b>.574</b>
CBO1	Organic methods have been used in agricultural activities.	.878			
CBO2	Treatment facilities have been built.	.819	20.487		
CBO3	The air, soil, and water have become clearer.	.646	14.525		
CBO4	The trees and green fields have been protected.	.733	17.324		
CBO5	Renewable energy sources, such as, solar, wind, etc., have begun to be used.	.687	15.803		
<b>FE</b>	<b>Equal Opportunities</b>			<b>.850</b>	<b>.588</b>
FE1	The rate of youth migration has decreased.	.800			
FE2	Female participation in labor force has increased.	.809	17.306		
FE3	The resources (energy, knowledge, physical area, etc.) necessary for production have been fairly distributed.	.791	16.893		
FE4	The local people have been sufficiently informed about the Cittaslow process.	.656	13.564		
<b>YG</b>	<b>Local Empowerment</b>			<b>.864</b>	<b>.616</b>
YG1	Small-scale enterprises, such as boutique hotels and guest houses have emerged.	.736			
YG2	The local manufacturers have begun to sell their products directly without mediators.	.880	17.232		
YG3	The local people have been encouraged to participate in production process.	.768	15.189		
YG4	Producer's cooperatives have begun to emerge.	.747	14.757		
<b>KYK</b>	<b>Urban Life Quality</b>			<b>.893</b>	<b>.736</b>
KYK1	New structures have been built in harmony with the historical and cultural texture.	.930			
KYK2	New parking lots have been built.	.860	24.318		
KYK3	Informative signboards have been placed throughout the streets and shops around the city.	.778	20.429		

After CFA, it is necessary to reveal the results regarding whether the measurement model was desired or not after ensuring the construct validity and reliability of the scale (Tabachnick and Fidell, 2013). Hooper, et al. (2008) was taken as a reference based on the explanation that suggests some indexes may create subjective values since they are oversensitive to sample volume and  $\chi^2/sd$ , SRMR, RMSEA and CFI indicators were determined as the fit indices that should be taken into consideration in this study. However, in order to be more objective, the indicators that are commonly used in studies, such as GFI, NFI, and NNFI, were also presented as suggested by McDonald and Ho (2002). At this stage, what needs to be considered is that the reason for frequently reporting some indicators, such as GFI, is not because they are sophisticated indicators, but because they have a long history (Hooper, et al., 2008). These indices and the values regarding these indices are given in Table 5 together with their references.

**Table 5.** Goodness of Fit Values regarding Cittaslow Sustainable Tourism Scale

<b>Fit Index</b>	<b>Accepted Value</b>	<b>Observed Value</b>	<b>Reference</b>
$\chi^2/sd$	$\leq 3$	2.983	(Kline, 2005; Çokluk, et al. 2014)
SRMR	$\leq 0.08$	0.0611	(Malhotra, 2010; Kline, 2005)
RMSEA	$\leq 0.08$	0.069	(McDonald and Ho, 2002; Hair, 2014)
CFI	$\geq 0.85$	0.874	(Doraisamy, et al., 2016; Reisinger and Mavono, 2006)
NFI	$\geq 0.90$	0.823	Malhotra (2010)
TLI*	$\geq 0.80$	0.861	(Reisinger and Mavono, 2006; Hooper, et al., 2008)
GFI and AGFI	GFI > AGFI	0.799 > 0.767	(MacCallum and Sehee, 1997)
$\chi^2 = 2114,870$ sd = 709 * NNFI index is mentioned as TLI in AMOS Program.			

When Table 5 is analyzed, it is observed that all indicators except for NFI are within the accepted fit range. Hooper, Coughlan and Mullen (2008) who stated that some indices may be biased because they are oversensitive against sample volume, stated that NFI and NNFI may show a weak fit in smaller sample volumes. However, when the main indicators considered as evaluation criteria for this study are analyzed, it is observed that all values are within the acceptable range. Thus, it may well be concluded that the measurement model generally complies with the existing data set. Along with the fit values, it may also be concluded that the measurement tool also carries ideal values in terms of reliability and construct validity.

In consideration of the above analysis findings regarding reliability and construct validity of the scale, it may be concluded that the impacts of Cittaslow Movement may be measured via the determined factor structure in terms of the research population.

### **Conclusion and Discussion**

By means of this reliable and valid Cittaslow Sustainable Tourism Scale, it is now possible to determine the dimensions of Cittaslow Movement's impacts on local people. These impacts can now be determined within the frame of the following dimensions:

- Increase in Value of Historical and Cultural Heritage,
- Increase in Production,
- Local-Cultural Belonging,
- Economic Growth,
- Environmental Awareness,
- Equal Opportunities,
- Local Empowerment,
- Urban Life Quality

The above dimensions found in this study reflect the dimensions of sustainable development, which is the underlying theoretical frame of this study. Accordingly, depending on the results related to "Increase in Value of Historical and Cultural Heritage", "Increase in Production", "Economic Growth" dimensions, the effects of the Cittaslow Movement on the economic sustainability of the region can be revealed. In addition, important results can be obtained about the environmental sustainability of the region, thanks to the variables of the "Environmental Awareness" dimension. Finally, the level of social sustainability of a Cittaslow can be determined based on the data obtained from the dimensions of "Local-Cultural Belonging", "Equal Opportunity", "Urban Life Quality" and "Local Empowerment".

### **Theoretical Contributions**

Within the scope of the main purpose of this study, it has become possible to compare the goals and expectations of the Turkish Cittaslow Organization and the actual impacts found at the end of this process. Thus, the differences between the expectations and the results can be revealed. As a result, it can be suggested that this scale, which can measure sustainability of tourism activities by determining the dimensions a slow city has made a progress or has fallen behind, is a genuine and original scale. In this respect, it can be claimed that an important scale has been brought to the literature in order to reveal new findings regarding the dimensions mentioned above.

When the literature is examined, qualitative researches on the effects of the Cittaslow Movement can be easily reached. But no comprehensive quantitative research has been found that includes more participant through the criteria peculiar to Cittaslow Movement. It will be possible to reach more participant with the scale developed to identify the findings about the economic, environmental and social statement of the region.

The dimensions in the scale can be considered as dependent or independent variables. Accordingly, new researches can be conducted on other areas that affect these dimensions or are affected by these dimensions. Thus, more comprehensive findings on Cittaslow Movement can be obtained.

Considering the universality of both slow city criteria and the sustainable tourism criteria and objectives, it can be argued that this scale can be used for the same purpose in all slow cities throughout the world. With this feature, the scale is considered to provide numerous benefits to international literature. In addition, considering the increase in the number of slow cities throughout the world, it can easily be concluded that this scale will become more important and will continue to be relevant in the upcoming years.

### **Practical Implications**

The aspects a slow city makes a progress or falls behind have a great impact on sustainability of the tourism activities in that region. Because this presents the characteristics of the factors that make a region an attraction center. For example, if the local people cannot benefit from the opportunities of a destination in terms of their life quality, they cannot be expected to offer a high-quality tourism experience to the tourists (Türker, Selçuk & Özyıldırım, 2016). For the local people, it is crucial to increase the quality of life in a tourist destination. Thus, they can participate actively and take pride in promoting the region they live in as a destination (Ramkissoon, 2020). In other words, they can contribute to the development of tourism in the destination, as well. (Erul & Uslu, 2022). Within this context, this scale enables us to reveal the thoughts and opinions of the local people living in slow cities on their social levels. This situation, which is given as an example on a social dimension, also applies to environmental sustainability. Thanks to the variables in the dimension of Environmental Awareness, the latest situation in terms of environmental sustainability of the region can be determined and necessary precautions can be taken in advance. Otherwise, as stated by Ramkissoon, Mavondo and Uysal (2018), visitors may stop or reduce visiting a place that is suffering from environmental damage. Although tourism has negative effects on a destination, it also has positive economic contributions (Nunkoo and Ramkinsoon, 2016). Accordingly, thanks to the scale developed, it will be possible to reveal whether there is an increase in production in the region, whether the historical and cultural heritage is transformed into an economic value, in short, the economic success of the Cittaslow Movement.

As can be seen this scale will be able to determine the current situation of a Cittaslow in terms of each dimensions in this scale. Also, these findings will be able to guide the activities to be developed by destination management organizations in order to attract tourists to their destinations and guide the coordination among all shareholders. In this respect, this scale is believed to play a significant role in destination planning.

This equal and harmonious approach within the process of structuring tourism activities without damaging the existing local, traditional, and ancient elements, and without taking their place can be described as Tourism Equinox (Arıkan & Ünsever, 2014). According to this Tourism Equinox approach, which is based on the



geographical equinox phenomenon, which only occurs twice a year, the Cittaslow Movement serves exactly for this purpose with its natural, cultural, and historical assets. Because the Slow Cities are not only tourism destinations, but they are also organizations that ensure a fair environmental, economic, and social order due to their close relationship with the dimensions of sustainable development. At this point, early detection of potential economic, environmental, or social deteriorations in a slow city plays a significant role in preventing greater issues that might occur in the future. At this stage, the Cittaslow Sustainable Tourism Scale will assume a significant function in ensuring the balance advocated by the Tourism Equinox approach.

Tourism paradox is the name given to this phenomenon, where the tourism industry destroys or deteriorates natural and cultural environment that is necessary for tourism activities. In this respect, the Cittaslow Movement is considered as a way out of this Tourism Paradox (Arıkan & Ünsever, 2012). At this point, Cittaslow Sustainable Tourism Scale will assume a significant function in order to get out of this Tourism Paradox. Because in relevant fields, this scale can be used as an important tool, which has been developed to reveal the data needed for determining the incomplete or missing qualities of a slow city.

### **Future Research and Limitations**

This scale, which has been developed to receive and take into consideration the opinions of the local people in order to determine the dimensions the slow city has made a progress or fallen behind, should be used by the administrative body of any particular slow city. Therefore, the underdeveloped areas in that city would be determined and necessary steps would be taken as soon as possible for sustainable tourism activities.

In addition to natural beauties, cultural and historical assets of a country, the assets of slow cities can also be considered as attraction elements by destination management organizations for marketing the region as a tourism destination. Within this process, determining the strengths and weaknesses of slow cities becomes crucial. Within this context, this scale can be used as an important tool to determine the strengths and weaknesses of slow cities for sustainable tourism.

The universality of this scale also paves the way for international research studies. Within this context, mutual studies may be conducted in order to determine the factors (cultural, political, etc.) that lead to international differences.

The universality of this scale also paves the way for international research studies. Within this context, mutual studies may be conducted in order to determine the factors (cultural, political, etc.) that lead to international differences.

### **Declaration**

All authors contribute equally to the article process. The authors have no conflict of interest to declare.

### **REFERENCES**

Altunışık, R., Coşkun, R., Bayraktaroğlu, S., and Yıldırım, E. (2012). *Sosyal Bilimlerde Araştırma Yöntemleri SPSS uygulamalı* (7.Baskı). Sakarya: Sakarya Yayıncılık.

- Alpar, R. (2013). *Uygulamalı Çok Değişkenli İstatistiksel Yöntemler* (4.Baskı). Ankara: Detay Yayıncılık.
- Arıkan, İ., & Ünsever, İ. (2012). Turizm Paradoksu ve Turizm Paradoksundan çıkış yöntemi olarak sakin şehir hareketi. *13. Ulusal Turizm Kongresi* (s. 181-193). Antalya: Akdeniz Üniversitesi.
- Arıkan, İ., & Ünsever, İ. (2014). Turizm Ekinoksu: Tarım ekonomisi odaklı yörelerde turizmin gelişim modeli. *Eko-Gastronomi Dergisi*, 1(1), 9-17.
- Büyüköztürk, Ş. (2014). *Sosyal Bilimler İçin Veri Analizi El Kitabı*. Ankara: Pegem Akademi Yayıncılık.
- Cameron, A. C. (2004). Kurtosis. M. S. Lewis-Beck, A. Bryman, ve T. Liao (Ed.), *Encyclopedia Of Social Science Research Methods*. (s. 543-544). California: SAGE Publications.
- Creswell, J. W. (2013). *Nitel Araştırma Yöntemleri* (Çev: M. Bütün; S. B. Demir). London: Sage Publication.
- Creswell, J. W. (2017). *Araştırma Deseni: Nitel, Nicel ve Karma Yöntem Yaklaşımları*. Ankara: (Çev. Ed: S. B. Demir). Eğiten Kitap.
- Çokluk, Ö., Şekercioğlu, G. & Büyüköztürk, Ş. (2014). *Sosyal Bilimler İçin Çok Değişkenli İstatistik SPSS ve LISREL Uygulamaları* (3. Baskı). Ankara: Pegem Akademi Yayıncılık.
- Dinçer, D. İ., Ofluoğlu, M. & Öz, M. (2015). Sürdürülebilirlik kapsamında sakin kent felsefesi ve yönetsel sorunlar: Halfeti örneği. *Doğu Karadeniz Bölgesi Sürdürülebilir Turizm Kongresi* (s. 325-336). Gümüşhane: Gümüşhane Üniversitesi Yayınları.
- Ekinci, M. B. (2014). The Cittaslow philosophy in the context of sustainable tourism development: The case of Turkey. *Tourism Management*, 41, 178-189.
- Erul, E. & Uslu, A. (2022). Yerel halkın turizm gelişmelerini destekleme niyeti: Manavgat örneği. *Journal of Tourism and Gastronomy Studies*, 10(1), 610-626.
- Güneş, G., Çalışkan Arısoy, E. & Aslan, E. (2015). Cittaslow ağına dâhil kentler ve sürdürülebilir turizm kriterlerine yönelik bir analiz. *Doğu Karadeniz Bölgesi Sürdürülebilir Turizm Kongresi* (s. 311-324). Gümüşhane: Gümüşhane Üniversitesi.
- Hair, J. F., Black, W., Babin, B., & Anderson, R. (2014). *Multivariate Data Analysis* (7. Baskı). New Jersey: Pearson.
- Hooper, D., Coughlan, J., & Mullen, M. (2008). Structural equation modelling: Guidelines for determining model fit. *The Electronic Journal of Business Research Methods*, 6(1), 53-60.
- Jung, T. H., Ineson, E., & Miller, A. (2014). The slow food movement and sustainable tourism development: A case study of Mold, Wales. *International Journal of Culture, Tourism and Hospitality Research*, 8(4), 432-445.
- Karadeniz, C. B. (2014). Sürdürülebilir turizm bağlamında sakin şehir Perşembe. *Uluslararası Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi*, 7(29), 84-107.
- Kartal, G., & Öztürk, S. (2016). Sürdürülebilir turizm bağlamında Cittaslow “yavaş şehir” hareketi ve bölgesel kalkınma ilişkisi. Ünidap Uluslararası Bölgesel Kalkınma Konferansı "Sosyal Kalkınma" (s. 344-363). Muş: Muş Alparslan Üniversitesi.

- Kline, R. B. (2005). *Principles and Practice of Structural Equation Modeling*. New York: The Guilford Press.
- Malhotra, N. K. (2010). *Marketing Research: An Applied Orientation* (6. Baskı). New Jersey: Prentice Hall.
- Mayer, H., & Knox, P. (2006). Slow Cities: Sustainable Places in A Fast World. *Journal of Urban Affairs*, 28(4), 321–334.
- McDonald, R. P. & Ho, M. H. R. (2002). Principles and practice in reporting structural equation analyses. *Psychological Methods*, 7(1), 64.
- Mertler, C. A., & Reinhart, R. (2002). *Advanced and Multivariate Statistical Methods* (2.Baskı). Los Angeles: Pyrczak Publishing.
- Miele, M. (2008). Cittaslow Producing Slowness Against the Fast Life Space and Polity. *Space and Polity*, 12(1), 135-156.
- Netemeyer, R. G., Bearden, W., & Sharma, S. (2003). *Scaling Procedures Issues and Applications*. London: SAGE.
- Nilsson, J. H., Svård, A.-C., Widarsson, Å. & Wirell, T. (2011). ‘Cittaslow’ eco-gastronomic heritage as a tool for destination development. *Current Issues in Tourism*, 14(4), 373-386.
- Nunkoo, R. & Ramkissoon, H. (2016). Stakeholders’ views of enclave tourism: A Grounded Theory Approach. *Journal of Hospitality & Tourism Research*, 40(5), 557-588.
- Özür, N. K. (2016). Sakin şehir cittaslow hareketi ve yerleşme coğrafyası. *SDÜ Fen Edebiyat Fakültesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 37, 151-179.
- Park, E. & Kim, S. (2016). The potential of Cittaslow for sustainable tourism development: enhancing local community’s empowerment. *Tourism Planning & Development*, 13(3), 351-369.
- Pink, S. (2008). Sense and sustainability: The case of the slow city. *Local Environment*, 13(2), 95–106.
- Ramkissoon, H., Mavondo, F. & Uysal, M. (2018). Social involvement and park citizenship as moderators for quality-of-life in a national park. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 26(3), 341-361.
- Ramkissoon, H. (2020). Perceived social impacts of tourism and quality-of-life: a new conceptual model. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 30(6), 1-17.
- Reisinger, Y., & Mavondo, F. (2006). Structural equation modeling: Critical issues and new developments. *Journal of Travel & Tourism Marketing*, 21(4), 41-71.
- Sander-Regier, R. (2004). In the spirit of Noah, food diversity and the slow food movement. *The Canadian Organic Grower*, Fall, 10-15.
- Saruhan, Ş. C. & Özdemirci, C. (2013). *Bilim, Felsefe ve Metodoloji* (3.Baskı). İstanbul: Beta Yayıncılık.
- Tabachnick, B. G. & Fidell, L. (2013). *Using Multivariate Statistics* (6. Baskı). New Jersey: Pearson.
- Tıraş, H. H. (2012). Sürdürülebilir kalkınma ve çevre: Teorik bir inceleme. *Kahramanmaraş Sütçü İmam Üniversitesi İktisadi ve İdari Bilimler Fakültesi Dergisi*, 2(2), 57-73.

Türker, N., Selçuk, Ş. & Özyıldırım, A. (2016). Turizmin Yerel Halkın Yaşam Kalitesi Üzerine Etkisi: Safranbolu Örneği. *Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi*, 1(6), 1-13.

UNEP. (2003). *Tourism And Local Agenda 21: The Role of Local Authorities in Sustainable Tourism*. France: United Nations Publication.

Ünal, M., & Zavalı, Y. (2016). Küreselleşme karşıtı bir hareket yavaş hareketi. *İnsan ve Toplum Bilimleri Araştırmaları Dergisi*, 5(4), 889-912.

Yurtseven, H. R., Kaya, O., & Harman, S. (2010). *Yavaş hareketi*. Ankara: Detay Yayıncılık.

#### Online Resources

www.cittaslow.org. <http://www.cittaslow.org/content/association>.

www.cittaslow.org. <http://www.cittaslow.org/content/charter>.

www.cittaslowturkiye.org. <http://cittaslowturkiye.org/#cittaslow>.

www.slowfood.com. <https://www.slowfood.com/what-we-do/>.

www.slowfood.com. <https://www.slowfood.com/about-us/>.